



Engineering
Department

December 11, 2025

6335 Selig Dr
Independence, OH 44131

216.524.1374
IndependenceOhio.org

Elaine Price

Planning Initiatives Specialist - Greenspace

2079 East 9th Street, Suite 5-300

Cleveland, Ohio 44115

Re: Appeal of OPWC Fiscal Year (FY) 27 Preliminary Score - Brecksville Road (S.R. 21) Phase 2&3 Water Main Replacements and Resurfacing Improvements

Dear DOPWIC evaluation team:

The City of Independence is grateful for the preliminary recommendation for the full request of funding for the Brecksville Road (S.R. 21) Phase 2&3 Water Main Replacements and Resurfacing Improvements project. Given the projects' scoring and proximity to the funding line, the City respectfully submits this appeal regarding the preliminary scores for the Infrastructure Condition, Health and Safety, and User Fees categories. Based on the published Preliminary Project Rankings, we believe the points awarded under these scoring criterion do not align with the information provided in our original application as outlined below.

Infrastructure Condition

The project received a score of **30** for the Infrastructure condition category. A score of 30 means that the infrastructure is in "poor" condition. We believe that given the condition of the roadway and water main combined, the overall condition of the infrastructure for which we are seeking funding is "critical", warranting a score of **35**. The roadway is in dire need of resurfacing, and contributes to a "non-compliance" situation as defined in the "critical" category in the application manual,

when traffic has to navigate around existing potholes and failed pavement.

Health and Safety

The project received a score of 50 for this category for a “continuous” condition per the application manual. Since this project includes “multiple critical factors”, it should be classified as “continuous with severe factors”, warranting a score of 55. The lead service connections and roadway condition both contribute to the severe factors. The roadway condition contributes to an unsafe vehicular facility due to the reduced capacity and erratic traffic movements that occur because of the pavement conditions.

User Fees

The project received a score of 0 for this category. As stated in the application, the City of Independence does not receive any user fees for these water mains. Other communities participate in the “Suburban Water Main Renewal Program” via an executed agreement with Cleveland Water, but Independence is subject to the original agreement which defines the responsibility of replacing distribution water mains on the City (OPWC Application Attachment C-8 Article 10). Cleveland Water collects fees, but those fees do not contribute to the replacement of these water mains and the City of Independence is solely responsible for the cost of replacement without any generated user fees. Additionally, a portion of the project is a “Road” project, and by definition, “Road” projects are awarded 5 points. Therefore, Independence should receive a score of 5 for this category, per the guidance in the application manual which states “Points will be awarded to projects that do not rely on user fees for general revenue”. This project does not rely on fees for either the water main or the roadway portion.

Thank you for your consideration of this appeal.

Sincerely,



Don Ramm, PE
City Engineer

