

**DISTRICT ONE PUBLIC WORKS INTEGRATING COMMITTEE  
STATE CAPITAL INFRASTRUCTURE PROGRAMS  
FISCAL YEAR (FY) 2025 APPEALS TO PRELIMINARY RANKING  
JANUARY 5, 2024**

The DOPWIC has approximately \$32,095,377 in OPWC funding, available through grants (State Capital Improvement Program [SCIP] and Local Transportation Improvement Program [LTIP]) and loans (SCIP and Revolving Loan Program [RLP]) in Round 2022-2023. The total funds allocated are shown in the following table.

<b>FY 2025 PROGRAM FUNDING</b>	<b>GRANTS</b>	<b>LOANS</b>
State Capital Improvement Program (SCIP)	\$ 16,734,556	\$ 2,375,839
Local Transportation Improvement Program (LTIP)	\$ 6,692,694	
Revolving Loan Program (RLP)		\$ 6,292,288
<b>TOTAL AVAILABLE</b>	<b>\$23,427,250</b>	<b>\$8,668,127</b>

**FISCAL YEAR (FY) 2025 PRELIMINARY SCORING OF PROJECTS AND STAFF RECOMMENDATIONS**

The DOPWIC received Thirty-nine (39) Applications. The DOPWIC staff evaluated and recommended scores for all project applications using the OPWC requirements, and District One methodology and evaluation criteria. All project applications were evaluated in relation to the other projects submitted in FY 2025. Each program year is separate and distinct from previous years.

DOPWIC Staff reviewed and recommended scores for all eligible applications per the twelve (12) criteria below:

<b>EVALUATION/SCORING CRITERIA</b>	<b>MAXIMUM POINTS</b>
Users	10
Infrastructure Condition	45
Infrastructure Age	17
Health and Safety Needs	55
Local Match	20
Loan Incentive	10
Access to Funds	6
Community & Economic Development	3
Regional Collaboration	2
Coordinated Infrastructure Projects	4
Economic Health	23
Generation of User Fees	5
<b>TOTAL POINTS</b>	<b>200</b>

The Preliminary Project Rankings were ranked numerically in order from the highest score to the lowest.

- **Primary Recommendations** are the top-ranked projects (#1 - #15) with requests that equal, or come close to, the FY 2025 total available funds.

#### **STAFF REVIEW OF APPEALS TO PRELIMINARY PROJECT SCORES**

Per the FY 2025 Applicant Manual, information that was not part of the original application submission was not accepted for an appeal of the project ranking.

One(1) applicant submitted appeals to the DOPWIC FY 2025 SCIP/LTIP Preliminary Project Ranking scores. The appeals sought increased scores or clarification in one or more of the following criteria:

- Infrastructure Condition
- Health and Safety

The DOPWIC Staff reviewed the appeal for merit; the recommendation and appeal letter are outlined below. For your review the appeal letter is also included after the Staff summary.

**1. CITY OF GARFIELD HEIGHTS – MARTIN LUTHER KING JR BLVD SEWER SEPARATION PROJECT****DOPWIC ID:** GAR-25-02**PRIMARY INFRASTRUCTURE:** Wastewater**RANKING:** # 23

USERS	AGE SCORE	INFRA- STRUCTURE CONDITION SCORE	HEALTH AND SAFETY SCORE	LOCAL MATCH SCORE	LOAN INCEN- TIVE SCORE	ACCESS TO FUNDS
10.00	17.00	35.00	50.00	16.20	0.0	0.00
COMMUNITY OR ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT SCORE	REGIONAL COLLABOR - ATION SCORE	ECONOMIC HEALTH SCORE	COORDINATED INFRA- STRUCTURE SCORE	USER FEES SCORE		TOTAL SCORE
1.00	0.00	19.00	2.00	0.00		150.20

**APPEAL:**

- ***INCREASE HEALTH & SAFETY SCORE to 55 Points***
- ***INCREASE INFRASTRUCTURE CONDITION to 40 Points***

The City of Garfield Heights stated that wet weather events regularly cause sewer backups leading to basement flooding with combined sanitary and stormflow due to insufficient size of the pipes and storm water influx. Based on community surveys submitted with the application, the applicant is requesting the score be increased to the maximum score of fifty-five (55) points. The Applicant determined that 42% of respondents experience flooding during light rain events and 75% of respondents experience flooding during heavy rain events. The Applicant stated that flooding incidents of polluted water pose extreme health and safety concerns for the residents.

The Applicant also requested that the Infrastructure Condition Score of thirty-five (35) points be re-evaluated. Based on the components of the existing sewer that are cracked, fractured, penetrated by roots, as well as experiencing infiltration at the joints; the applicant claims that this project should have received a score of forty (40) points for Infrastructure Condition. The Applicant also cited the pavement condition in requesting a higher score.

**STAFF RECOMMENDATION:**

- **MAINTAIN HEALTH & SAFETY SCORE at 50 Points**
- **MAINTAIN INFRASTRUCTURE CONDITION at 35 Points**

The DOPWIC Staff reviewed the community surveys to re-evaluate the Health and Safety Score. Only sixteen (16) households of the forty-seven (47) direct users submitted surveys. Five (5) households submitted multiple questionnaires. The DOPWIC Staff determined the following percentages based on the direct users:

- Approximately 19% of the users answered that they have basement flooding during light rain; and
- Approximately 28% of the direct users answered that they have basement flooding during heavy rain.

The Applicant did not include any flooding reports, maintenance calls, or photographs of the flooding events. Thus, the DOPWIC Staff recommends maintaining the points for Health & Safety Score at 50 points.

The DOPWIC Staff also reviewed the Infrastructure Condition documentation in the application. The Infrastructure Condition Score is based on the primary infrastructure indicated in the Application, which is wastewater. The Pipeline Assessment Certification Program (PACP) score submitted is a three (3); The PACP Rating system is pasted below:

Score	Condition
5	Immediate attention needed
4	Poor; will become Grade 5 in near future
<b>3</b>	<b>Fair; moderate</b>
2	Good; has not begun to deteriorate
1	Excellent; minor defects

([https://www.ohiowea.org/docs/03\\_Sewer\\_Conditions\\_Rehab.pdf](https://www.ohiowea.org/docs/03_Sewer_Conditions_Rehab.pdf))

The DOPWIC Staff evaluated this application in relation to the other wastewater projects submitted in FY 2025. With a PACP rating of three (3), the condition is not as bad compared to other sewer/stormwater projects submitted this round and is consistent with the applied methodology. Thus, the DOPWIC Staff recommends maintaining the Infrastructure Condition at 35 points.

## POTENTIAL IMPACT TO PRELIMINARY PROJECT RANK

If the DOPWIC approves the DOPWIC Staff recommendations at the meeting on January 26, 2024, no changes will occur to the Preliminary Project Rankings posted on the Cuyahoga County Planning Commission website on December 5, 2023. The following projects will be recommended accordingly in OPWC WorksWise:

**Primary Recommendations** will include the top-ranked projects. **#1 to #15.**

1. DPW-25-02, Rockside Road Bridges 03.32 & 03.23 Improvement
2. DPW-25-03, Schaaf Road Bridge 02.89 Replacement
3. ECL-25-01, Shaw Avenue Reconstruction and Watermain Replacement
4. DPW-25-04, Warner Road Culvert 00.20 Replacement
5. CLE-25-01, Carnegie Avenue Phase 2 Rehabilitation (E. 79th Street to MLK Jr. Drive)
6. MAP-25-03, Southwest Sewer Improvement Phase II
7. FVP-25-01, Stanford Water, Sewer and Pavement Service Improvement Project
8. MBH-25-01, Smith Road Realignment
9. CLE-25-02, Payne Avenue Phase 2 Rehabilitation (E. 30th Street to E. 55th Street)
10. PAR-25-01, Craigleigh Drive Septic Abatement Project
11. DPW-25-01, Grant Avenue Rehabilitation
12. BRK-25-01, Sheldon Road Rehabilitation
13. RMH-25-02, Wilson Mills Resurfacing
14. OAK-25-02, Broadway Avenue Resurfacing Project
15. STV-25-01, Wastewater Treatment Plants B & C Rehabilitation\*

\*Partial Funding Recommended.

**Secondary Recommendations/Contingency Projects** WorksWise will be assigned to the projects ranked **#16 to #25**

16. LAK-25-01, 2025 Watermain Replacement
17. NOS-25-01, Clague Road Rehabilitation
18. BRL-25-01, Southwood Drive Waterline Project
19. OAK-25-01, Alexander Road Septic Conversion Project\*\*
20. ROC-25-01, Rockcliff Drive Sewer and Pavement Improvement
21. MAP-25-01, Lee Road Phase 1 Resurfacing Project
22. PAR-25-02, Krueger Avenue Area Sewer Improvements Phase III
23. GAR-25-02, Martin Luther King Jr. Boulevard Sewer Separation Project
24. NBH-25-01, East 26<sup>th</sup> Street Capital Improvement Project\*\*
25. GLW-25-01, Cochran Road Phase II Reconstruction PY38 Project\*\*

\*\* Projects Recommended For OPWC Small Government Commission.

The DOPWIC Staff recommends the DOPWIC allow the following changes based on the WorksWise submission:

- *Allow OPWC to make changes to the recommended grant or loan source of funds, to maximize the funding available to award in rank order as many projects as possible.*
- If projects are recommended for the Small Government Program add subsequent projects in rank order to the Contingency list.
- If contingency funds are awarded to the 10 projects submitted in WorksWise; and there are remaining funds available, allow OPWC to re-open the Round and add subsequent projects in rank order to the Contingency list.